

# Environment Scrutiny Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: **2nd September 2010**

Meeting Number: **29**

Present	Deputy P Rondel (Chairman) (PR) Connétable J Refault (JR) Deputy D Wimberley (Vice Chairman) (DW)
In attendance	M Haden , Scrutiny Officer M. Orbell, Scrutiny Officer

Ref Back	Agenda matter	Action
	<b>1. Records of meetings</b>  The minutes of the meetings of 15 <sup>th</sup> and 23rd July and 17th August 2010 were approved and signed.	
<b>15.07.10 Item 2</b>	<b>2. St Helier in-vessel food waste composter</b>  The Panel agreed to request a briefing from the Connétable of St Helier;	<b>MH</b>
<b>15.07.10 Item 2</b>	<b>3. Incineration ash and asbestos at La Collette</b>  The Panel agreed to request the Minister for Transport and Technical Services to reconsider his current policies for dealing with these materials in the long term.	<b>MH</b>
<b>19.05.10 Item 3</b>	<b>4. Carbon Intensity of Imported Fuels:</b>  The Panel agreed to endorse the Minister's conclusions as set out in his letter dated 17th August 2010 from the Minister of Planning and Environment.	<b>MH</b>
<b>19.05.10 Item 3  514/1(19)</b>	<b>5. Farm Shops - Review</b>  The Panel noted the information provided by the Assistant Director, Performance and Operations, in his letter dated 10th August 2010 and agreed to consider the outcome of the review when available.	<b>MH</b>
	<b>6. Wood Pellet Stoves - Building Regulations</b>  The Panel recalled its visit to Fuel Farms and the complaint that Building Regulations did not permit horizontal venting for wood pellet stoves. The Panel noted that BRE (British Research Establishment) had not offered a view on this issue in response to the Panel's request. It was agreed however to take no further action in regard to this issue as this was a commercial matter.	<b>MH</b>
<b>514/1(14)</b>	<b>7. Town Park Remediation Scheme:</b>  The Panel noted the summary paper which had been prepared by Transport and Technical Services Department. The Panel agreed to request clarification of the following issues:  (i) on site treatment of residual low level contaminated materials: in view of the surrounding residential properties concern was expressed about the potential for contaminated material to escape	

	<p>from the site during the aeration process;</p> <p>(ii) transport of heavily contaminated materials through the town: The Panel requested assurances regarding the safety of loading vehicles and transporting the material through the town;</p> <p>(iii) provision of cover system to prevent contact with residual contamination: The Panel asked whether the membrane was permeable to rainwater. It was also suggested that there should be some form of constructed access to existing services which would remain below the liner system to ensure that the membrane was not damaged in the course of future repairs to these services;</p> <p>(iv) unforeseen additional contaminants/variation in the number of lorry loads required: The Panel was concerned about the cost implications which might arise from the variability noted in the document. The Panel wanted assurance that rising costs would not lead to any compromise in respect of the methodology of dealing with contaminated material</p> <p>(v) Environmental Impact assessment: The Panel requested assurance that this had been carried out.</p> <p>The Panel agreed that it might be appropriate to seek expert advice on the proposed remediation scheme and requested the Scrutiny officer to make enquiries with wca environment and to draw up a scoping proposal and budget for this piece of work.</p>	MH
514/1(22)	<p><b>8. Provision of Public Toilets: Topic Proposal</b></p> <p>The Panel considered a proposal to examine current provision of public toilets in the Island. The Panel agreed in the first instance to request clarification from:</p> <p>(i) the Planning and Environment Department regarding the framework for provision of public toilets in commercial premises; and</p> <p>(ii) the Transport and Technical Services Department regarding access to public toilets particularly at night time.</p> <p>The Panel noted that the Communities and Local Government Department in the UK had published a Strategic Guide to Improving Public access to Better Quality Toilets.</p>	
15.07.10 Item 9 514/14(8)	<p><b>9. Protecting Our Marine Environment Review</b></p> <p>The Panel received an update report from the Scrutiny Officer regarding submissions received for this review. The Panel agreed a draft timetable for initial fact-finding visits by its adviser and subsequent public hearings.</p>	MO
17.06.10 Item 9 514/9(8)	<p><b>10. Energy from Waste Plant and Ramsar Review</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that the Ramsar Secretariat had not yet received a response to its letter to the Panel on 30th March 2010 supporting the Panel's conclusion that an article 3.2 report be submitted. It was recalled that the Department had written formally to DEFRA stating its</p>	

	<p>reasons why an article 3.2 report was not considered to be a requirement. It was further noted that DEFRA had responded to the Department requesting clarification, before writing to the Ramsar Secretariat, that the construction and monitoring of the plant would be carefully monitored to ensure that the conclusion of no impact on the adjacent Ramsar site was borne out in practice. The Panel agreed to seek reassurance from the Department that this confirmation would be forthcoming.</p> <p>The Panel also agreed to request</p> <p>(a) an update on the investigation into the alleged environmental incident at the EfW construction site in 2009; and</p> <p>(b) clarification of the powers of the Regulator in the event of any failure to comply with the conditions of the Waste Management Licence</p> <p>(c) progress report from the Planning and Environment and Transport and Technical Services Departments on implementing the recommendations of the Panel's report</p>	MH
<p><b>15.07.10</b> <b>Item 10</b></p> <p><b>514/1(20)</b></p>	<p><b>11. Provision of Bottled Water: Quality and Taste of Mains Water</b></p> <p>The Panel received the Managing Director, Jersey Water, for a discussion on the monitoring and regulation of water quality and the factors affecting the taste of water provided by Jersey Water.</p>	
<p><b>28.01.10</b> <b>Item 4</b></p> <p><b>514/10(8)</b></p>	<p><b>12. Energy Efficiency in States Buildings</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that the Deputy Chief Executive, Chief Minister's Department, was considering a proposal from a set of consultants to undertake a pilot review of the States Property portfolio looking specifically at energy and utility management. The consultants' intent was to show that they could offer a minimum of 10% savings on current consumption and costs for selected buildings. The Panel welcomed this proposal in principle which was in line with its previous investigation into energy efficiency measures.</p> <p>The Panel noted that, in a recent review in Guernsey undertaken by the same consultants, savings over £500,000 had been identified. The Panel requested further details of this review.</p>	MH
<p><b>15.07.10</b> <b>Item 7</b></p> <p><b>514/1(21)</b></p>	<p><b>13. Draft Sustainable Transport Policy</b></p> <p>The Panel received a briefing paper from the Scrutiny Officer setting out initial comments on the draft policy. The Panel acknowledged that the report was set at a high level of aspirations and that considerable improvements had been made to the draft policy in the course of its previous discussions with the department; however, the Panel remained disappointed at the cautious approach adopted, particularly in respect of identifying the costs and long term benefits of delivering the various initiatives contained in the proposals. The Panel felt that there was a lack of clarity about how the targets set in the policy would be achieved while intended improvements to items such as the taxi and school bus services were still to be developed and in general a lack of incentives to the public to take positive action to change travel choices.</p> <p>The Panel agreed that its report on the draft policy should focus on encouraging the Minister to take the vision forward and deliver the</p>	MO

	transport improvements envisaged in the policy.	
<b>28.01.10</b> <b>Item 4</b>  <b>514/1(18)</b>	<p><b>14. Panel Work Programme - review</b></p> <p>The Panel considered a briefing paper from the Scrutiny Officer setting out progress on matters identified within its work programme.</p> <p>The Panel noted that a confidential draft of the Energy Policy had now been made available and that it was expected that a White Paper would be published for public consultation shortly. The Panel requested officers to hold initial discussions with departmental officers about the draft policy prior to scoping its review.</p> <p>The Panel also considered a request from the Chairmen's Committee to select a suitable topic for the next Scrutiny newsletter and the Home Life Exhibition in November. It was suggested that the provision of bottled water, the Protection of the Marine Environment or the draft Energy Policy could be suitable topics and requested the Scrutiny Officers to develop these options.</p>	<p>MH/MO</p> <p>MH/MO</p>
	<p><b>15. Matters for Information</b></p> <p>The Panel noted the following matters:</p> <p>(a) Briefing Notes of Chairmen's Committee meeting held on 15th July 2010</p> <p>(b) Dates for Citizenship programme</p> <p>(c) Ministerial Decisions for the period to 27th August 2010.</p> <p>(d) Date of next scheduled meeting: 7th October 2010</p>	

Signed



Date:



Chairman Environment Panel